



# Good Intentions...?

An essay using the *Canada in the Making* site

## Teacher Guide

It's said that the road to hell is paved with good intentions. Was this the case with the treaties made between European colonial administrations and the Canadian government when dealing with Aboriginal peoples? This essay will require students to examine the motives behind treaty documents and government act and to examine the documents in order to determine whether government or colonial negotiators lived up to the promises they mouthed.

---

### Subject/Grade Level

Social Studies/History  
Ages 15 and up

### Overview

Some have suggested that Europeans wanted only to seek a peaceful coexistence with Aboriginal peoples; others have argued that Europeans wanted only one thing – space to grow, at any cost. This is an essay requiring that students describe the historical events surrounding a treaty, decide what the motives were behind the treaty, and make an argument on whether or not the treaty accomplished what it was intended to accomplish.

Research for this essay should require should take three to four hour-long sessions online, depending on whether students have access to a print versions of relevant documents. *Note that the sources used in ECO can be printed from the browser and then photocopied.*

### Outcomes (WCP, APEF)

See the [table and the summaries](#) for each province.

### Expectations (ON)

### Objectives (QC)

### Materials/Resources Required

Newspaper clippings or other periodical information on land claims settlements of treaty disputes in Canada.  
Computers with Internet access.  
Student Work Sheet.  
Suggested Rubric.

### Links

Early Canadiana Online: *Canada in The Making*  
URL: <http://www.canadiana.org/citm/>  
Essay writing resources can be found in the *Writing An Essay* unit on ECO:  
URL: <http://www.canadiana.org/eco/english/lessonp.html>

Other links can be found in the Student Work Sheet.

## **Previous Knowledge**

Students will need

- An understanding of Web navigation symbols, tools and terminology, particularly the tools used in ECO.
- Familiarity with research and essay writing skills.
- A basic understanding of the basic shape of Canadian history, especially from the 18<sup>th</sup> century on.

## **Lesson Opener**

Introduce the subject of treaty disputes. Ask students what they think the origins of the dispute are. Discuss:

- What purpose they think treaties served.
- Do the original intentions of the framers of treaties still have relevance today?

## **Procedure**

Hand out Student Work Sheets and introduce students to the *ECO Canada In the Making* Web site. Read the assignment and discuss. Students may work in groups to facilitate research online. The documents are summarized in the *Canada in the Making* section on “Aboriginals: Treaties and Relations,” and the documents are linked from there.

Students should write the essay from a particular perspective. For example:

- Colonial officials/the Canadian government bargained from a position of strength, and had no intention of honouring its promises in the long run. The Aboriginal nations involved had little choice but to accept.
- At the time the treaty was negotiated, Europeans had only a weak foothold on the continent, and negotiated in the hopes of finding peace/gaining allies. The Aboriginal nations involved hoped to use a more friendly European power to stave off a less friendly one. Both intended to honour the treaty.

## **Summary**

Hold a discussion. Did the motivations behind treaty making change over time? In what ways, if any? What key events changed the balance of power?

## **Evaluation**

See the Suggested Rubric.

## **Homework/Extension**

Students map the key events that changed the balance of power between Aboriginal peoples and European colonial governments/the Canadian federal government. Place the major treaties on the timeline.



## Good Intentions...?

An essay using the *Canada in the Making* site

### Student Work Sheet

It's said that the road to hell is paved with good intentions. Was this the case with the treaties made between European colonial administrations and the Canadian government when dealing with Aboriginal peoples? This essay will require you to examine the motives behind treaty documents and government acts and to examine the documents in order to determine whether government or colonial negotiators lived up to the promises they mouthed.

---

Some have suggested that Europeans wanted only to seek a peaceful coexistence with Aboriginal peoples; others have argued that Europeans wanted only one thing – space to grow, at any cost. This is an essay requiring that you:

- Describe the historical events surrounding a treaty,
- Decide what the motives were behind the treaty, and
- Make an argument on whether or not the treaty accomplished what it was intended to accomplish.

You should write the essay from a particular perspective. For example :

- Colonial officials/the Canadian government bargained from a position of strength, and had no intention of honouring its promises in the long run. The Aboriginal nations involved had little choice but to accept.
- At the time the treaty was negotiated, Europeans had only a weak foothold on the continent, and negotiated in the hopes of finding peace/gaining allies. The Aboriginal nations involved hoped to use a more friendly European power to stave off a less friendly one. Both intended to honour the treaty.

You may find it useful to conduct your research in groups.

### Choosing a Document

Select a significant treaty or government act from one of the following sections of the site:

1. **1499-1779: From First Contact to the Peace and Friendship Treaties**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals2\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals2_e.html)
2. **1763-1791: The Royal Proclamation, 1763, and Québec Act, 1774**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals3\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals3_e.html)

3. **1764-1836: Pre-Confederation Treaties I**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals4\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals4_e.html)
4. **1811-1867: Pre-Confederation Treaties II**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals5\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals5_e.html)
5. **1867-1870: The *British North America Act, 1867*, and Sale of Selkirk Treaty Lands**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals6\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals6_e.html)
6. **1871-1875: The First Five Numbered Treaties**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals7\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals7_e.html)
7. **1876-1877: The *Indian Act, 1876***  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals8\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals8_e.html)
8. **1876-1877: Numbered Treaties Six and Seven**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals8\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals8_e.html)
9. **1899-1922: Last of the Numbered Treaties**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals10\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals10_e.html)
10. **1923-1950: The Williams Treaties and Land Transfer Agreements**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginal11\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginal11_e.html)
11. **1951-1981: The Aboriginal Rights Movement**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals12\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals12_e.html)
12. **1982-2003: Constitutional Reforms and Crises**  
URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals13\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/aboriginals/aboriginals13_e.html)

Try to avoid treaties which were minor – for example, one settled between a private person and a band and intended to obtain land for a building.

## Essay Requirements

The paper should be \_\_\_\_\_ words long. It should contain:

- A title page with a title, your name, the course name, your teacher's name and the date submitted.
- A clear introduction with a thesis statement.
- Proper citation (footnotes/endnotes or APA/MLA style, as determined by your teacher).
- A bibliography.

Make an effort to use primary sources to support your arguments. These can be found on the *Canada in the Making* Web site.

## Note on Sources

### Primary sources

Primary sources represent the most authentic resources that historians can draw upon. The documents that you will be using below may be digitized, but are still considered primary sources. Try to use the sources available on the “Aboriginals: Treaties and Relations” portion of the *Canada in the Making* Web site to strengthen your arguments.

For tips on how to use primary sources, go to the “Using Primary Sources in Your Work” page.

URL: <http://www.canadiana.org/eco/english/lessonp.html>

### Secondary sources

Secondary sources are works that interpret or analyze an historical event or phenomenon. Generally the author is at least one step removed from the event. Although not as authentic as primary sources, secondary sources are still valuable.

## Possible Sources of Information Online

**Note:** It is important to choose sources that are produced by reputable institutions or individuals. Such information is more likely to give you a balanced, neutral view and be prepared or reviewed by experts.

### Numbered Treaties

*Canada in the Making*: An Overview of the Numbered Treaties

URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/specifique/written/written\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/specifique/written/written_e.html)

### General

*Canada in the Making*: Aboriginals: Treaties and Relations

URL: [http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/constitution1\\_e.html](http://www.canadiana.org/citm/themes/constitution1_e.html)

The Canadian Encyclopedia Online

URL: <http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com>

Natural Resources Canada: The Atlas of Canada

URL: <http://atlas.gc.ca/site/english/maps/historical/indiantreaties/historicaltreaties>

Indian and Northern Affairs: The Historic Treaty Information site

URL: [http://www.ainc-inac.gc.ca/pr/trts/hti/site/maindex\\_e.html](http://www.ainc-inac.gc.ca/pr/trts/hti/site/maindex_e.html)

National Archives of Canada: *Pride and Dignity*

URL: [http://www.archives.ca/05/0501\\_f.html](http://www.archives.ca/05/0501_f.html) (French)

URL: [http://www.archives.ca/05/0501\\_e.html](http://www.archives.ca/05/0501_e.html) (English)



## Good Intentions...? Suggested Rubric

---

### Application of Conventions (Mechanics) (Language Arts)

Uses correct spelling, grammar and punctuation	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Follows format of a formal essay (title page, double-spaced, etc.)	0	1	2	3	4	5		

### Organization of Ideas (Language Arts)

Has a clear and captivating introduction with a thesis statement	0	1	2	3				
Logical organization	0	1	2	3	4	5		
Has proper annotation and bibliography	0	1	2	3	4	5		

### Communication of Knowledge (Social Studies/History) Communication (Language Arts)

Examines topic from perspective chosen, and stays on topic	0	1	2	3	4	5					
Supports argument well using different sources	0	1	2	3	4	5					
Demonstrates an understanding of the issues	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10

### Understanding of Concepts (Social Studies/History) Reasoning (Language Arts)

Has a clear and logical conclusion that makes a reasoned statement about the topic	0	1	2	3	4	5			
--	---	---	---	---	---	---	--	--	--

Essay Total: /50